Testing Message Appeals for Obesity Prevention Among Low-Income Audiences: What Is a Compelling Argument?

National Conference on Health Communication, Marketing and Media
August 20, 2013

Presented by:
Alyssa Ghirardelli, MPH, RD, Research Scientist
National Opinion Research Center, San Francisco, CA

Formerly with: Network for a Healthy California
California Department of Public Health

Collaborators: Larry Bye, MS, Martin Barron, PhD, Susan Foerster, RD, MPH, Sharon Sugerman, RD, MS, FADA
Network for A Healthy California
Social Marketing Campaign

EVERYDAY
Healthy Meals

Actividad
Física
Por Tu Salud. Tu Comunidad.

Real Moms
Healthy Kids
What you need to know about nutrition and physical activity.
Moms share their ideas, tips, and stories.

Mi cocina.
Mis reglas.
Regla #1:
Comer más frutas y vegetales.

Fruits and Vegetables
The Flavor of Life
A healthy life starts with your shopping cart.
Advertising Campaign 2008-2009

• “Ownership”
• **TV**—English, Spanish 2,  
  – :30 spots
• **Radio**—Spanish Only 2,  
  – :60 spots
• **Direct Mail Marketing**  
  – (6 counties)
• **Outdoor, Catering Trucks**
• **TV Transit** (LA only)
Advertising Campaign 2008-2009

“Ownership”

My kitchen. My rules.

Rule #1:
Eat more fruits and vegetables.

My television. My rules.

Rule #2:
Turn it off and go out and play.

Our neighborhood. Our rules.

Rule #3:
We speak up for healthy changes.
Advertising Campaign 2010, 2012

- “What’s Harder”
- **TV**—English, Spanish 2,  
  - :30 spots
- **Radio**—Spanish Only 3,  
  - :60 (2) and :90 (1) spots
- **Outdoor, Catering Trucks**
- **Transit TV** (LA only)

- [http://www.cdph.ca.gov/programs/cpns/Pages/TVSpots.aspx](http://www.cdph.ca.gov/programs/cpns/Pages/TVSpots.aspx)
Advertising Campaign 2010, 2012
“My Rules” Continued, New Rules

My shopping cart. My rules.
Rule #5: Buy more fruits and vegetables.
Advertising Campaigns 2013
Targeted Latino and African American

“A Mis Hijos No/Not My Kids”
- Spanish TV (1)
  :30 spot
- Spanish Radio (2)
  :60 spots
- English TV (1)
  :30 spot
- English Radio (2)
  :60 spots
- Outdoor
- Transit TV (LA only)
- Digital (web banners, etc.)

“Legacy”
- TV (1) (eventually 2)
  :30 spot
- Radio (2)
  :60 spots
- Outdoor
- Transit TV (LA only)
- Digital (web banners, etc.)
Advertising Campaigns 2013
“A Mis Hijos No”

Caminen juntos hacia un futuro más saludable.

Aprenda más en www.AMisHijosNo.net
1-888-328-3483
Advertising Campaigns 2013
“Legacy of Health”

My new legacy is a healthier family.

Learn more at www.LegacyOfHealth.net
1-888-328-3483
Media Evaluation Survey

Mothers age 18-54 of school aged children 6 - 17 years old

– 1000 telephone interviews California SNAP/CalFresh recipients
– 1000 interviews with very low-income (≤130% Federal Poverty Level) Not SNAP/CalFresh recipients
Media Evaluation Survey

- Computer-assisted telephone interviewing (CATI) for the SNAP/CalFresh Recipient sample
- For the SNAP/CalFresh Eligible sample data are collected in shopping malls in low-income census tracts in media markets
- Race/ethnicity quotas are set for in-person interviews
  - One-third African American,
  - One-third Hispanic,
  - One-third Others
- Data are weighted by race/ethnicity only
Media Evaluation Survey Findings: Aided Recall of Any Ads

- **SNAP/CalFresh Recipients**
  - 2010, 52%
  - 2011, 57% (no ad campaign running)
- **SNAP/CalFresh Eligibles**
  - 2010, 52%
  - 2011, 58% (no ad campaign running)
- **Spanish-speaking SNAP Eligibles**
  - 2010, 71%
  - 2011, 57% (no ad campaign running)
- **Spanish-speaking SNAP Recipients**
  - 2010, 74 %
  - 2011, 56 % (no ad campaign running)
Findings: Ad Recall Associations

Self-Efficacy
- Personal F/V
- Personal PA
- Family Change for Healthy Eating
- Family Change PA

Normative Beliefs
- Personal F/V
- Personal PA
- Family Change F/V
- Family Change PA
Findings: Ad Recall Associations

• Particularly compelling since the campaign was designed around self-efficacy concepts through “Champion Mom” strategy with real moms as role models

• Normative beliefs not emphasized in campaign elements, but important intermediate factor to measure and may be used as baseline
Remaining Questions

• What messages resonate?
• If we strip away production features, what are the underlying arguments that potentially drive behaviors or predictors?
• What are compelling arguments?
• Which *Network* objectives are most actionable by low-income audience?
• Questions CANNOT always be answered through focus group methodology
Research Design

• Experimental Design:
  – 400 participants
  – English and Spanish
  – Exposure to 3 message platforms
  – Randomized message delivery
  – Pre-Post Test

• Desired Outcomes:
  Intention to perform desired behaviors
  – Increase fruit and vegetable consumption
  – Increase healthy eating behaviors

• Quantitative and Qualitative Items
Use of Framing Theory to Create Structure of Appeals for Formative Research

Entman (1993) suggests a way to think about or “frame” ideas or events

1. Define problems, raise salience
2. Make moral judgments
3. Suggest remedies
Content Framing in Journalism

• Content or issue framing is evident in journalism, news and other reporting

• Shen, Lee, Sipes, & Hu, 2012 used unique “message frames” to compare concepts in journalism related to causal factors of obesity

• Episodic frame = personal responsibility

• Thematic frame = societal factors or social environment
Use of Framing Theory

• Drew from content framing in journalism
• Used framing theory to provide the structure of the messages
• To create "why" for target receivers or audiences to make individual or family change behaviors
• Message content also drew from theories in health behavior, psychology and communication
Frame 1: Outcome Evaluation: Social justice

Frame 2: Normative Influence: Join the movement

Frame 3: Control Beliefs: Parental protection

(Fishbein, Cappella, 2006)
Video Stimulus: Three Appeals or Arguments for Obesity Prevention

**Social Justice, n = 134**
- Also based on *Network* community objective to increase access to healthy foods

**Social Normative, n = 131**
- Strong theory supported through evidence base and easy to integrate into *Network* messaging “Champion Moms”

**Parental Protection, n = 126**
- To consider new approach that directly raises concern of target audience and also included in targeted Latino campaign
News clips to raise salience, define the problem

Credible expert to provide moral judgment

Text slides with voice over for remedy and recommendations

Making Childhood Obesity Prevention the New Normal:

- #2 Join together with your family, friends & community
  - Buy or grow healthy foods together, like making time to go to a farmer’s market or community garden
  - Prepare healthy meals with children and friends
  - Share healthy recipes and ways to be physically active
Increase Salience- Define problem/ Diagnose Causes (newscaster)
News story type content focused on community conditions
Lack of healthy foods in low-income neighborhoods
Overabundance of fast food
Lack of safe places for families to play

Make Moral Judgment (Expert- Female)
Residents of low-income communities have poor access to healthy food
They have the right to have access

Suggest a Remedy (Text slide w/ voice over and photo montage- Female)
Residents can make changes to bring healthy food to neighborhood
Community groups can get together to decide what to do
Community change can create family change
Social Norms Appeal
Thematic and Episodic Frames

Increase Salience- Define problem/ Diagnose Causes (newscaster)
News story type content on unhealthy communities and individuals
More people are making changes, but there is still a problem with obesity
Many low-income neighborhoods are putting in farmers markets, community gardens, etc.

Make Moral Judgment (Expert- Female)
Things are changing in families and neighborhoods to eat healthy
People see the need to make personal and community-wide changes
More people need to join the movement

Suggest a Remedy (Text slide w/ voice over and photo montage-Female)
Join the movement to eat healthy and be active
Moms are doing things together to shop and prepare healthy foods
Moms are learning from each other- supporting each other
When ready to join, here’s how you do it
Increase Salience- Define problem/ Diagnose Causes (newscaster)
News story type content showing obesity epidemic covering individuals
Parents want the best for their kids, care for kids, but hard to say no
Kids are at risk for obesity, chronic diseases, type II diabetes

Make Moral Judgment (Expert-Female)
Parents are responsible for health of children
More families need to take control for healthier lifestyles- shop, prepare, eat healthy
Parents need to make better choices to prevent obesity in their families

Suggest a Remedy (Text slide w/ voice over and photo montage-Female)
Parents can be role models and gatekeepers
Parents can have healthy foods and drinks at home, eat out less, etc
Parents can get active with their kids
Important to take action to protect family/kids to prevent obesity
Analysis

• Principal component analysis to identify variables to retain and create aggregated components
• T-tests for planned comparisons among components
• Comparison of appeals against each other for intermediate outcomes and intentions
• Intermediate outcomes (scaled components):
  – Self-efficacy for individual and family level healthy eating behaviors and physical activity
  – Normative beliefs
• Significance testing at .05 and .10 levels
Results: Quantitative

• Social Normative Appeal
  – Significant finding for greater normative beliefs to personally cut back on sugary drinks & fast food and to set limits on unhealthy food and drinks among family
  – Compared to Social Justice appeal
    \( t = 0.174, \ -0.124, \ p < .05 \)
  – Compared to Parental Protection appeal
    \( t = 0.174, \ -0.047, \ p < .10 \)
  – Results evident in outcomes relative to message appeal
Results: Quantitative

- Normative Belief Component Variables
  People you know:
  - Cut back on eating fast food…
  - Cut back sugary drinks like soda…
  - Set limits on unhealthy foods they have in the home…
  - Set limits on sugary drinks they have in the home…
  - Set limits on the amount of time their children watch tv…
  - Eat less often from fast food…
  - Discourage children from eating fast food…
Results: Quantitative

• General Rankings

• Social Normative Appeal
  – For 11 components covering intentions, self-efficacy and normative beliefs
  – Ranked evenly with Parental Protection, both getting highest ranking 5 times
  – Social Justice ranking the highest on only one component, 6 times lowest
  – Comparing ranked scores, with lower score denoting higher ranking
    • Social Norms (18)
    • Parental Protection (22)
    • Social Justice (26)
Results: Qualitative Responses

I like that “there's a lot more of the community being involved. That childhood obesity is being taken more seriously.”

The main message is:
“get together with family and friends to learn and share healthy eating habits. Make more fresh fruits and vegetables available to the children.”

“We have a problem with obesity in our children. We need to come together and take action.”

Further qualitative analysis is underway
Summary

- Social Normative appeal appears to perform better to influence intermediate behavioral factors for obesity prevention relative to message strategy.
- Parental Protection close second on effect, but not in expected outcome components.
- Qualitative responses show incredible interest to all appeals.
- Social Justice messaging however, did seem to raise awareness of specific ideas such as access to healthy food and food deserts, but combined with shock and concern.
- Social Normative appeal to be integrated into campaign strategy and messaging.
Proposed Campaign Using Normative Appeal

Audio: Powerful music up throughout

Visual Note: Indoor exercise may be different, push-ups or sit-ups. Family will include father.

VO: More and more families like yours

Visual note: Everyone will have water in glasses

VO: are making healthy changes in their lives every day.

We're cooking healthier meals.

We keep it moving every day!

We're drinking more water.

We want our kids to grow up healthy.
Thanks!

Alyssa Ghirardelli, MPH, RD
Research Scientist
National Opinion Research Center
San Francisco, CA

This study was completed while at the
Network for a Healthy California
California Department of Public Health

Ghirardelli-Alyssa@norc.org